

November 2020

Ignatian-Centered and Appreciative Advising: Supporting the Holistic Development of Students in 15-Minute Intervals

Joseph DeFeo Ph.D.

Association of Jesuit Colleges & Universities, jdefeo@ajcunet.edu

Bridget Keegan Ph.D.

Creighton University, bridgetkeegan@creighton.edu

Follow this and additional works at: <https://epublications.regis.edu/jhe>

Recommended Citation

DeFeo, Joseph Ph.D. and Keegan, Bridget Ph.D. (2020) "Ignatian-Centered and Appreciative Advising: Supporting the Holistic Development of Students in 15-Minute Intervals," *Jesuit Higher Education: A Journal*: Vol. 9: No. 2, Article 7.

Available at: <https://epublications.regis.edu/jhe/vol9/iss2/7>

This Scholarship is brought to you for free and open access by the Scholarly and Peer-Reviewed Journals at ePublications at Regis University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Jesuit Higher Education: A Journal by an authorized administrator of ePublications at Regis University. For more information, please contact epublications@regis.edu.

Ignatian Leadership Collection

Ignatian-Centered and Appreciative Advising: Supporting the Holistic Development of Students in 15-Minute Intervals

Joseph DeFeo
Executive Director of the Ignatian Colleagues Program
Association of Jesuit Colleges & Universities
jdefeo@ajcunet.edu

Bridget Keegan
Dean of the College of Arts & Sciences
Creighton University
BridgetKeegan@Creighton.edu

Abstract

Ignatian Pedagogy offers a powerful vision and methodology for learning and for life. The majority of work devoted to Ignatian pedagogy focuses on its integration into the traditional curriculum and classroom. However, as many educators are aware, learning, reflection, and self-discovery continue after and between courses and class meetings. Here the role of the faculty or staff advisor is essential, providing continuity and longer-term accompaniment for the student over the course of his or her educational career. This essay examines how Ignatian pedagogy builds upon and enhances secular theories of advising and how Ignatian Pedagogy can inform advising relationships. Finally, we will offer practical strategies for implementing Ignatian Pedagogy and spirituality in advising relationships to promote student development.

Background and Context

In 2016, faculty and staff in the College of Arts and Sciences at Creighton University renewed their commitment to undergraduate advising and formed a task force to enhance academic advising in ways that would more fully enact our commitment to our Catholic, Jesuit mission. At Creighton, academic advising is conducted primarily by faculty. However, faculty are supported by a number of staff members, many with particular specialties (such as pre-health professions or career services or supporting student athletes or first-generation students). At Creighton, as at many other institutions, advising is thus a responsibility that is shared by different departments or offices. While the sense of shared commitment for student success is essential, it can sometimes lead to discontinuities in the information a student might receive about graduation requirements as well as to inconsistency in the experience a student has in obtaining information or making important decisions. Most members of the advising taskforce

were committed to and knowledgeable about Ignatian spirituality and Ignatian Pedagogy.

While Ignatian spirituality and Ignatian Pedagogy include specific practices for enacting their core concepts (or charisms) and principles, which might certainly be adapted to the goals and context of advising, the group felt that developing additional concrete structures or techniques that could be shared among all those who engaged in advising activities would assist in creating coherence and continuity for students and for faculty and staff alike. This goal was all the more important since, given the number of faculty and staff who engaged in advising activities, many of whom were relatively new to the institution, a deep familiarity with Ignatian spirituality could not always be presumed.

Task force members researched and studied the robust scholarship around best practices in higher education advising. Because most experts agree that advising is a form of teaching, the majority of theoretical approaches to advising align with pedagogical theories (e.g., Socratic or Freirean

advising).¹ After extensive exploration and conversation, the group was struck by how Appreciative Advising presented useful parallels and intersections with important aspects of Ignatian spirituality and Ignatian Pedagogy.² While secular approaches like Appreciative Advising do not articulate a theologically-informed worldview, many of its guiding values and assumptions appeared to complement the principles and practices of the Ignatian Pedagogical Paradigm (IPP). It seemed that Ignatius and his first followers may have understood intuitively the concepts of what would be called Positive Psychology 450 years later. To explore the possibilities for integrating the techniques of Appreciative Advising into our Ignatian-informed advising philosophy, the College invited Dr. Jennifer Bloom, one of the founding scholars and practitioners of Appreciative Advising, to campus twice. We also sent a representative to the Appreciative Advising Institute summer workshop. Finally, we invited Dr. Joseph DeFeo, a leading expert in Ignatian spirituality and Pedagogy, to assist us in thinking through how we might effectively integrate these two different schools of thought. The following essay is based upon his plenary presentation.

Although what follows suggests some theoretically informed practices, several other essays in this special issue present additional activities and assessments that were informed by the discussion below. We recognize that Creighton is not the only Jesuit institution that is engaged in more robustly informing advising and students success activities with the Ignatian mission and values. *The Chronicle of Higher Education* has featured how Le Moyne University and Loyola University Maryland have developed ambitious and exciting comprehensive programs.³ Additionally, while our commitments as educational apostolates of the Society of Jesus mean that Jesuit colleges and universities will necessarily have unique ways of delivering mission, including specific vocabulary and traditions, we believe that the ideas explored in this essay may be meaningful to educators at other faith-based institutions and potentially to those in public higher education as well.

Definitions/Caveats

Ensuring student success, broadly defined, is the goal of every academic institution. Many individuals, programs, and offices contribute to the quality of a student's undergraduate experience. Because each student is unique, the combination of individuals, programs, and offices that a student will engage with is similarly unique. Moreover, a student's learning opportunities extend beyond the classroom and occur in her residence hall, through her co-curricular activities, with her job or internship and in every other activity that is directly or indirectly connected with her college education. Even as every student is assigned an official academic advisor, the student will receive advice that impacts her overall success as a student from an even wider range of individuals. As "official" advisors are well aware, family members and fellow students are often highly influential on a student's decisions. Those who are most influential on a student's journey are ideally their mentors. A mentor's role is to help the student think through her "big questions"—not just the "what" of her decisions in college, but the deeper "why" and the sometimes trickier "how." Landmark studies on students' personal transformation in college, such as Richard Light's *Making the Most of College* or Sharon Daloz Parks's *Big Questions, Worthy Dreams*, attest to the fact that having a mentor plays a pivotal role in student development and in a student's ability to find and make meaning in their lives.⁴

The roles of teacher, advisor, and mentor are distinct, but they can often overlap. For example, a student may encounter a faculty member in a course in her major, may then ask that faculty member to serve as her academic advisor for the major, and over the course of working together, the student will come to rely on that faculty member not only for practical advice on which classes to take but on how to integrate her academics with broader interests and a future career. University students are always assigned an academic advisor (just as they are always enrolled in classes); however, not every student is able to develop a relationship with a mentor. Mentoring can evolve from advising or teaching relationships, thus we might say that these roles exist on a continuum. However, often the logistical and temporal constraints of advising and teaching

inhibit such a development. Most undergraduate faculty teach a significant number of students each term. Likewise, even in smaller schools, most advisors are working with more than a few students. If advisors are not interacting with students in an academic class, their ability to engage with students may be focused on specific times in the academic year, such as the period around course registration. What if we could draw from our rich understanding of Ignatian pedagogy and its effectiveness in the classroom and use it to transform the majority of advising relationships into something more like mentoring relationships? More students would thus have access to those important relationships that help to ensure their ability to make the most of their experiences. Such relationships are all the more critical if we wish to help form students as leaders and agents of positive social change, as Jesuit institutions aspire to do.

It is our belief that through marrying concepts and techniques from Ignatian Pedagogy and Appreciative Advising we can offer to academic professionals—whether faculty or staff—strategies that everyone who advises students might embrace. We can create the conditions by which any one of a student’s advising relationships (whether with a formal or informal academic advisor) could evolve toward a mentoring relationship. In what follows we proceed by describing first the key concepts and practices associated with Ignatian Pedagogy and Ignatian spirituality, especially as they are relevant to both advising and mentoring. We then turn to a discussion of the philosophy and techniques of Appreciative Advising, subsequently indicating where these might resonate in productive ways with the Ignatian approach. The essay concludes with a variety of concrete suggestions for enacting some of the insights gained from putting Ignatian Pedagogy and Appreciative Advising in dialogue. Creighton University’s Haddix Ignatian Advising Program, described in other essays in this issue, has begun to implement this approach and, as other contributors describe, initial results are promising.

Ignatian Pedagogy

“Vision without appropriate method may be perceived as sterile platitude; while method without unifying vision is frequently passing fashion or gadgetry.”

—Vincent Duminuco, S.J.⁵

Formally titled the Ignatian Pedagogical Paradigm, Ignatian Pedagogy is “the way teachers accompany learners in their growth and development.”⁶ While Ignatian Pedagogy was widely popularized in the late 20th century, it originated in the early 1500s, when Ignatius and his first followers developed their “way of proceeding” that incorporated not only an approach to education, but to all aspects of the order’s apostolic work and to the lives of individual Jesuit priests. Ignatian Pedagogy describes this particular way of proceeding both in and out of the classroom. Beginning with his conversion and extending over the course of his lifetime, Ignatius developed his worldview which was grounded in his belief in God and the Christian scriptures and refined his methodology from a retreat program he created called the *Spiritual Exercises*.⁷ Written when he was a lay person, Ignatius’ *Spiritual Exercises* was derived from noticing how God worked with him during his own conversion experience and continuing throughout his life, deepening his understanding of himself and his relationship with his God.

Mentoring and Ignatian Accompaniment

A vital component of Ignatian Pedagogy is the way in which teachers accompany learners. To journey with, to walk besides another, sets up a relationship between teacher and student that allows students to directly encounter and wrestle with ideas and concepts and claim their own ideas, independence, and sense of self that can lead to decisions and actions, selection of courses, majors, and possibly careers. Working alongside the learner, an Ignatian educator considers his or her role as one of accompaniment, journeying with the student as she grapples directly with a search for meaning and purpose. The concept of mentoring, introduced above, particularly mentoring of young adults as Sharon Daloz Parks describes, provides a helpful overview of what accompaniment might accomplish in Ignatian Pedagogy.⁸

Mentors support and champion the competence and potential that a student represents. Parks describes mentors as people who care about a student's soul as well as her mind, convey inspiration, and respect the company of the young adult. Mentors provide recognition. That is, they "see" the capacities and giftedness of the young adult, even if she doesn't yet see it herself. Parks further describes mentoring as a complex and intricate two-step process of supporting and challenging at the same time. It is a practice of what is often referred to as "tough love." Moreover, mentoring occurs in dialogue: it is a conversation not a lecture. It calls forth the voice of the young adult to speak with integrity and power. Mentors pose questions that go straight to the heart of the matter and spur a response from the mentee. Academic advisors are not responsible for, or expected to, engage in all aspects of an advisee's life, or even the many roles that mentors can play in their mentee's development. That said, the founding concept of accompaniment in Ignatian Pedagogy can help advisors better understand the context of their advisees' lives and situations, build a deeper sense of rapport and trust, and provide a safe space for advisees to more meaningfully explore options during advising sessions. Such accompaniment may lay the groundwork for a deeper mentoring relationship.

From a foundation based on accompaniment, Ignatian Pedagogy includes both a vision and five-step method for life and for learning.⁹ One of the gifts of the Ignatian tradition is a vision of the human being and the world as good, holy, and sacred. It seeks to have humans discover their deepest desires and to live lives of authenticity. At the same time, an Ignatian vision is grounded in the reality of one's time, location, and culture, as well as one's individual gifts and limitations. When combined with its five-step method (which incorporates context, experience, reflection, action, and evaluation) Ignatian pedagogy provides the means of engagement for learning about oneself, others, the realities of the world, and opens up possibilities for responding to self and others creatively and constructively. In as much as advising is another form of teaching, albeit one that occurs outside of the typical temporal limitations of the class period or the

semester-long course, it can be productively informed by the Ignatian Pedagogical Paradigm.

Worldview and Horizon of Ignatius

The worldview stemming from Ignatius and Ignatian spirituality includes a vision that is world affirming, believing that the world and the people in it are more good than suspect. It is one in which there is care and concern for each and every person, a respect for the dignity of all persons, and is value-oriented. The Ignatian worldview proposes the person of Jesus Christ as the model of human life. It includes an active commitment to strive to live authentically and to be of service to those in need. It pursues excellence in all that it does. It adapts to the times, people, and situations to achieve its purposes, and is accountable to the reality of the times. Such a vision requires diversity and inclusion and seeks justice and equity in relationships among all. As a vision and worldview, it sets the horizon toward which educators can point, guide, and encourage students. Importantly, the horizon is an incredibly wide one which welcomes and genuinely needs persons from all walks of life, those with or without a faith-life, and inviting of all humanistic and religious perspectives.

Such a horizon invites educators to reflect not only on what they teach and how they teach, but also toward what end or purpose they are teaching. Again, in as much as advising is teaching, the Ignatian paradigm invites advisors to actively reflect upon how and to what ends they are guiding students, asking themselves to identify their deeper hopes and desires for students. If the Ignatian vision aims to develop students into the most authentic version of themselves, it also invites educators to strive toward their own authenticity. The Ignatian horizon and one's striving toward it creates many opportunities for transformational experiences, even in the potentially brief interactions of an advising relationship.

Ignatian spirituality, as it informs Jesuit education, values learning that occurs not only in one's intellect but in one's heart as well. The affective dimension of personal growth is central. Engaging the senses and encouraging the imagination allows students to identify their deeper desires as they

seek to understand academic material and themselves. The premise that education includes the head and the heart has significant implications for the way Ignatian educators and advisors think about the learning process and the way they conduct learning opportunities including advising. Learning can certainly happen using just one's intellect. But when learning occurs in ways that engage both the intellect and the emotions, it takes on a new dimension. Many in the academy chose to become an expert in their area not only because that area was intellectually challenging but also because they personally connected to something in it. In other words, they fell in love with it in some way, enough to invest their lives into making that field the cornerstone of their careers. As we consider our role as educators, isn't our goal to help our students fall in love with something, whether that is an idea, a concept, or a practice? The Ignatian vision and five-step method provides some practical steps for both faculty and advisors to help students to discover something they may fall in love with.

Ignatian Pedagogy in Action: A Five-Step Method

Enacting the broad vision and goals of Ignatian pedagogy is an active-learning methodology that includes the dynamic interplay of five key areas: Context, Experience, Reflection, Action, and Evaluation.¹⁰ At the heart of this methodology is an ongoing cyclical process of the Experience/Reflection/Action process during which the teacher or advisor values and includes the student's individual context and lived experiences.

Context requires an understanding of the student's reality, the circumstances, environment, and culture of his or her world. This includes the institutional environment of the campus. Having some understanding of the student's world, what is influencing them, and what matters to them is important. It helps establish a healthy rapport and trust and a means to better assist with students' decision-making and ultimately their own growth and development.

Experience provides students with opportunities that get them involved and interested. It is a hook to draw them in to a topic, a problem, or an

opportunity. Ignatian spirituality describes experience as "to taste something internally."¹¹ Discussing experiences targets a student's emotions, imagination, and creativity as something that engages the senses. It can make students excited, interested, disturbed, or challenged. By drawing in students in ways that tap into their senses and emotions, we invite students to pay attention and consider an issue as they are personally engaged with it.

Reflection provides time and space for students to think about a subject more deeply, to make connections to their own lives, and to see the world in new ways. In many ways, reflection addresses the question, "So what?" Engaging students in reflection invites them to ask questions such as, "What does this subject mean *to* me, and what does it mean *for* me?" Reflection allows the student to make learning, and the particular ideas or concept, personal. It provides the opportunity to grasp more fully the significance of the idea, insight, theorem, or experiment and how that idea might be manifested in a learner's life and plans. It also provides the space where students may recognize or identify how ideas, concepts, and disciplines are connected deeply to their own desires for who they seek to become.

Action stems from those times when, after reflection, students recognize that an idea, concept, or reality strikes a chord with them and there is a genuine interest or passion relating to it. Action is the phase that encourages students to take a stand, make a judgment, or take some action. It invites them to make this newly discovered and owned "truth" their own by doing something with it. Some actions can be visibly witnessed, as when they take their love of a discipline and begin their own undergraduate research project. Other actions are choices that are interiorized and while not visible, have a significant effect on their awareness or behavior.

Evaluation seeks to consider how students have grown and matured above and beyond assessing their mastery of course content. Ignatian evaluation is a mix of observation, assessment, and mentoring. It provides an opportunity for further relationship building between teacher or advisor and student. It enables educators to encourage progress already made, as well as to

review course material in light of their values, attitudes, priorities, and short- or long-term goals. Evaluation can also be a time to consider different perspectives of the material covered. When part of a course, the review of a student's journal can help them recognize points of growth along with areas for further study. Review of particular essays or projects can also provide opportunities for students to consider particular values, biases, or perspectives they may hold. For an advisor, it might mean reviewing developments in a student's academic and co-curricular plan. When all of those who engage with students take time to ask students the broader questions, a student's college experience is enhanced greatly in areas that further her holistic development. One of the limitations for faculty is that they sometimes see students for only one semester or year. Advisors, by contrast often have the opportunity to see students over the course of one or more years. Advisors can assist students by asking them to evaluate how their course work is connected and remark upon how they have grown or matured themselves, above and beyond their grades or course project performances.

The components of Ignatian Pedagogy that shape the educational process foster a continual desire to know one's own personal life and truth, as well as the world. Not all components need to be followed in each class or advising session. Some aspects might take on more prominence than others such as reflective exercises, action projects, or first engagement of material through reading, videos, or awareness raising. Yet, Ignatian Pedagogy offers a continuous cycle providing a way to gain greater depth and breadth of learning opportunities.¹² While the five-part methodology of Context, Experience, Reflection, Action, and Evaluation alone can inform effective teaching, the richness and depth of Ignatian Pedagogy manifests most fully when the vision and goals of Jesuit education and its spiritual foundation remain intentionally connected to its pedagogical application. At its best, the vision and method of Ignatian Pedagogy provides the opportunity for students to fall in love with an idea, a concept, or a discipline. It also provides a more intentional invitation for students to deepen their love of self, others, and a desire to share their gifts with the world.

Additional Core Concepts, Practices, and Key Vocabulary

In addition to Ignatian Pedagogy, when one works at a Jesuit institution or engages in Ignatian spirituality, one quickly finds there exists a set of values and a particular language to describe the Ignatian tradition that reflect its past and present culture. These terms help us remember our tradition and consider how we might strive to foster that tradition within our current time, place, culture, and the particular audience we are serving. Ignatian terms and concepts such as *Cura Personalis*, *Vocation*, *Ignatian Examen*, *Interior Freedom*, *Ignatian Discernment*, and *Magis* can inform the advising process as they may apply to guiding principles and practical tactics in the advising relationship and its potential outcomes. Below are brief descriptions of each.

Cura Personalis is one of the most often mentioned elements of what differentiates Jesuit education. Many writers have explored the deeper meaning and implications of this term; however, a brief definition is "care for the whole person."¹³ While such care can be accomplished in a variety of ways, it indicates an attitude that seeks to not only get to know the usual facts about a student (major, hometown, career aspirations) but which seeks to consider the student's holistic formation, in mind, body, and spirit.

Vocation: Jesuit education often uses the language of helping students find not only jobs and careers but also their *vocation* or, from the word's Latin origin, their *calling*. One helpful description of vocation is attributed to Frederick Buechner. Vocation is "the place where your deep gladness and the world's deep hunger meet."¹⁴ In Ignatian spirituality we often notice that our "deep gladness" occurs when our most authentic desires for ourselves and for life reside and the world's deep hunger points to those places and people in our society who are most in need. Jesuit education seeks to form students in ways that help them identify their "deep gladness" through reflection on their lives, and then to claim and use their gifts and talents to be of service to those who are marginalized or suffering.¹⁵

Ignatian Examen: As described above, reflection is a key component of the five-step method of

Ignatian Pedagogy as it provides the opportunity for learners to consider what the material, idea, concept, problem, or reality means to them and for them personally. Formally titled the Examination of Consciousness, the Ignatian Examen is a way for one to review each day in the context of one's larger hopes and desires.¹⁶ Designed to be a short prayer or reflection period of about five or ten minutes, the Examen asks one to look back on the day and to consider those areas where one is grateful, what one wanted for oneself, where one experienced love, where one could not meet the requests of others, and what one feels hopeful about tomorrow. The Ignatian Examen can be adapted to a variety of audiences such as students, faculty, and others.¹⁷ As the foundation of a regular practice of reflection it can create the space to ask deeper questions.

Interior Freedom: Related to reflection, one of the overall goals of Ignatian spirituality is to help one seek *interior freedom*.¹⁸ Sometimes also referred to as "indifference" or "non-attachment," through a process of deepening one's knowledge of self and identifying one's deepest desires, one begins to notice those areas in which an experience, a memory, a fear or something else, has an unhealthy hold upon them, limiting how one considers options, ideas, actions, or larger life choices. Ignatian spirituality offers techniques to recognize these areas of "unfreedom" and address them so that one might attain what Chris Lowney identifies as "freedom from" to enable "freedom for" one to consider options more authentically.¹⁹

Ignatian Discernment: One of the great gifts that Ignatian spirituality provides is helping one to make good decisions. Ignatian discernment, as the term suggests, is the process that allows us to sever or separate what is essential or "better" in decision making.²⁰ Ignatian discernment is always about a choice between two good options. It requires an honest appraisal of oneself, one's gifts, limitations, desires, or fears. It requires some awareness of where one is "not free," as well as recognition of where and when one is more interiorly free. The goal is to make the "better" choice, given the realities of those involved, the time, place, culture, and restrictions. The choice provides "the better" way for one to live more authentically.²¹

The Magis: Choosing "the better" option in discernment connects to an essential Ignatian term, *Magis*.²² The *Magis*, while frequently translated as "the more," can sometimes be misinterpreted, especially in the context of higher education. The idea of the *Magis* is to consider the options in front of us and to make the better choice. In spiritual terms that would be the choice that enflames the heart and brings more spiritual joy and love. Contrary to some expectations, it does not mean always choosing the harder or more self-sacrificing option (it may, but it is not the criteria for the choice). It does not mean just doing "more" or taking on "more." The *Magis*, as Ignatian discernment describes it, requires that a person's real-life context, relations, obligations, gifts, and limitations be considered to determine how that person, given their reality, can best live his or her most authentic life.

Appreciative Advising

With this description of Ignatian Pedagogy and key elements of Ignatian spirituality and Jesuit higher education, we turn now to describing Appreciative Advising and suggest where these two frameworks might productively intersect. Appreciative Advising provides a theoretical and practical basis for engaging students. Its founding assumption is that advising is more than mere problem-solving, utilizing those "problems" as opportunities to delve deeper. Appreciative Advising focuses not only on a student's cognitive growth, but also her metacognitive and affective growth. As a form of teaching, it seeks to develop students' analytical, creative, and evaluative skills. On a metacognitive level, it seeks to develop a student's ability to reflect upon and monitor her cognitive processes. These skills help students learn about themselves and develop resilience to meet personal challenges. Appreciative Advising also recognizes that students, especially in our current culture, may experience high levels of anxiety which can lead to feeling stuck or lost, sometimes severely. Lowering or removing stressors enhances students' ability to address challenges thoughtfully. Appreciative Advising seeks affective growth to ease student anxiety, encourages setting high expectations, and empowers students to challenge themselves and fulfill their highest aspirations.

Appreciative Advising's theoretical foundation stems from a combination of social constructivism (seeing the interaction between students and advisors as a social interaction); positive psychology that draws on the well-being, positive emotions, relationships, and happiness of students; and Appreciative Inquiry (AI), which considers building advising interactions toward greater positive change. Through concepts derived from AI, advising is envisioned as a positive endeavor rather than one that is solely problem-based. It approaches a student's academic planning by asking what is possible as opposed to correcting perceived deficiencies.

The methodology of Appreciative Advising is configured into six creatively-themed phases for advisors to engage students: *Disarm*, *Discover*, *Dream*, *Design*, *Deliver*, and *Don't Settle*.²³ While these phases do not perfectly align with the five elements of Ignatian Pedagogy, as we will discuss, they each resonate with components of the Ignatian approach to education. As advisors meet with and work with students, they can further engage in each of these areas. Bloom's publications include full descriptions and practices for these areas; however, we offer a brief description of each.

The *Disarm* phase recognizes that the initial advising encounter can produce anxiety for students, as they may be uncomfortable sharing their plans with an unfamiliar person who they fear might need to "approve" their choices. Advisors are encouraged to prepare for the initial meeting and do what they can to *Disarm* those anxieties. They are encouraged to use positive, active, and attentive listening and questioning, and to build trust and rapport with the students. Finding practical ways to put students at ease lays a helpful foundation for the future work.

The *Discover* phase seeks to uncover the student's strengths and skills based on her past successes. One example Bloom provides invites advisors to recall our own student experience of bringing home a report card that had almost all good grades with one low grade and having our parents focus on just the low grade. By empathetically helping students remember their own skills and strengths, advisors can encourage students to use those skills to guide their choices.

The *Dream* phase, when done with an advisor, helps the student initiate the process of realizing her dreams through concrete strategies to name or visualize them. Bloom writes that an advisor can assist a student to dream by asking directed questions that also engage their emotions and their senses. She writes, "Imagine that you are on the front cover of a magazine 20 years from now. The article details your latest and most impressive list of accomplishments. What is the magazine? Why have you been selected to appear on the cover? What accomplishments are highlighted in the article?"²⁴

While students may exhibit some apprehension about sharing their dreams, a supportive advisor who has begun to build trust can be extremely helpful in this process.

The *Design* phase allows advisors to help co-create with students and develop clear plans for going forward. This includes helping the student to consider what they might need and providing resources that the student may not be aware of, especially those beyond coursework, such as the high-impact opportunities that enhance the experiential dimension of learning. Advisors can recommend internships, leadership opportunities, service-learning programs and more. Bloom suggests that advisors pose some useful questions for this phase. She writes, "What can you do in the next week to move one step closer to at least one of your goals?" and "Let's brainstorm on the resources you will need to accomplish these goals and objectives."²⁵

The *Deliver* phase provides the student encouragement to carry out her plan to realize her dreams. It provides academic hope and can be a time of emboldening students in their own sense of agency. Advisors in the *Deliver* phase provide external accountability to the student and might ask questions such as "How and when are you going to keep me updated on your progress? What strategies will you employ when you run into obstacles along the pathway to your goals?"

The final phase, *Don't Settle*, encourages students to continue to reach their aspirations. Advisors may serve as role models helping students to raise their expectations of and for themselves. Appreciative advisors may wish to first learn about the goals a student has already met and

celebrate them. They can then offer motivating questions such as, “Even though you have done a great job, what is one thing you could do even better?” The *Don’t Settle* phase includes an awareness of past successes and an optimistic and forward-thinking attitude of continually seeking new opportunities.

In and of itself Appreciative Advising offers beneficial techniques based upon proven theories of student development. It is a process that seeks to build a relationship between advisors and students, help students move past any apprehensions, and recognize their skills and accomplishments as a springboard for the current aspirations. Advisors can be of great assistance to students by inviting them to consider where they are and what they seek to do by encouraging them to think big, helping them create a game plan for success, and providing ongoing support to ensure that students succeed. Appreciative Advising provides a strategic educational method that incorporates reflective learning.

Contributions of Ignatian Pedagogy and the Ignatian Tradition to Advising: Accompanying Students in 15-Minute Intervals

As we hope may be already partially evident, the concepts and approaches of Ignatian Pedagogy and Appreciative Advising have elements in common. It is our belief, based on ongoing efforts at Creighton, that creatively combining the two can help advisors and students build a richer and more productive relationship, allowing increased opportunities for advising to become more like mentoring. Even when time is limited, Appreciative Advising is particularly useful in providing clear but pointed questions that advisors can ask students to consider and continue reflecting on well after the advising session ends. Such questions can be reframed to have an Ignatian inflection and vocabulary that can address the spiritual dimension of a Jesuit education. By planting seeds through asking important and direct questions, the Ignatian advisor can more fully contribute to a student’s quest for learning about herself, what she values, and what she wishes to further investigate. For advisors, framing the advising relationship as accompaniment (both for the advisor herself and

for the student) can help to frame interactions to always aim beyond the transactional. This can assist in building trust and openness. The Ignatian framework can also help bring the additional richness of mentoring into the activity of advising.

Sharon Daloz Parks, one of the most thoughtful scholars of mentorship, stresses that one of the most important things mentors can do is to ask “big-enough questions.”²⁶ The Appreciative Advising method suggests advisors ask key questions to help students Dream in order to think creatively, imaginatively, and boldly. An Ignatian advisor would also ask similar questions but may also include questions that help students consider the meaning of their life and how they might consider living it. An Ignatian approach broadens the context for the dialogue between student and advisor and frames it in terms of transcendent values that may offer clearer guideposts for students in their process of meaning-making.

Questions that Parks suggests for mentors are also helpful for Ignatian advisors to ask their advisees. Advisors might use such questions to introduce and use a shared Ignatian vocabulary that the student will be hearing used by faculty and staff across campus. Some of Parks’ questions include:

- What do I really want to learn?
- When do I feel most alive?
- What constitutes meaningful work?
- What is the meaning of money? How much is enough? Am I wasting time I’ll regret later? Where do I want to put my stake in the ground and invest my life?
- What do I really want to become?²⁷

These “big” questions put more immediate issues in perspective and provide the opportunity for the student to further formulate her own vision, horizon, or worldview. These are precisely the questions that are nurtured by Ignatian approaches. Such questions can be nuanced by invoking the ideas of vocation, “freedom for,” and the *Magis*. Additionally, the importance of service and addressing the needs of those at the margins can be integrated, depending on the student’s interests. We believe that Ignatian advisors should

listen with a *mentor's ear* for the deeper desires in a student's responses in order to draw out a student's underlying motivation, passions, or concerns. Ignatian principles can serve as a touchstone for advisors in framing their attentiveness to their advisees.

The Disarm phase of Appreciative Advising offers valuable strategies for helping students feel less anxious and more comfortable about meeting with an advisor. Ignatian advisors, similar to faculty who use Ignatian Pedagogy, can help disarm student anxieties by showing their familiarity with some aspects of a student's life. Advisors would do well to tour a residence hall, dining facility, and campus center, and pay attention to student activities on and off campus to get some sense of what students are encountering. As advisors prepare for their sessions with students, *context* from Ignatian pedagogy would have them consider questions such as, "How might I prepare to serve this particular student given her unique needs, interests, skills, and challenges, at this particular point in her educational career?" Engaging in conversation, even briefly, about some aspect of a student's broader experience can go a long way in creating a healthy working relationship with an advisee.

The concept of *cura personalis* can deepen that relationship as it encourages advisors to honor the student's perspective. It asks advisors, and all Ignatian educators, to revere student ideas and viewpoints by first trying to understand, accept, and respect each student before offering specific advice. From a spiritual point of view, *cura personalis* would have educators look for ways in which the Spirit, God, Deity, or Truth is speaking and present in this relationship. The idea of *cura personalis* also presumes a depth of care for one's students. While it might seem difficult to cultivate or communicate such a sense of caring in 15-minute appointments, if advisors consider their interactions collectively and over time, such a concept can assist advisors in how they prepare for and engage students during the individual meetings.

The Discover phase seeks to build upon the student's past successes in order to respond to the issue or opportunity at hand. While reviewing past achievements, Ignatian advisors can consider how

they might engage their advisees' affective response to deepen their connection and generate creativity in looking at possibilities for curricular and co-curricular pathways. For example, by asking questions and noticing reactions about current events and cultural movements, an Ignatian advisor might gauge their advisee's interests or spark possibilities to explore. A discussion of a social problem, such as homelessness or poverty, might spur the student to further exploration through a service project, volunteer activity, or community-based learning or research.

The Dream phase provides the encouragement for students to imagine, or remember, why they are engaged in education, or a particular major or focus, in the first place. It helps them to think big and consider the immediate in light of the future. Ignatian advising complements the Dream phase by helping students to consider their deeper desires of what they really want, not only for their careers, but also for their lives. In the Ignatian tradition, assisting students to name and claim their deeper desires is key to discovering one's vocation. This is not a utopian or unrealistic list of wants or hopes. Rather, it is a sincere and honest striving to become the most authentic human person one can, based on one's reality, history, time, and place. Ignatian advisors, by asking questions about the larger concept of vocation, encourage students as they dream of their careers, to consider who they are, whose they are, and who they desire to become. Having an ongoing conversation about dreams and deeper desires, Ignatian advisors help students claim their own agency and authenticity. Practicing the Ignatian Examen can help students notice more about their identity and deeper desires. Regardless of whether they engage the Examen from a spiritual or secular perspective, over a period of time, the process increases their ability to notice more about themselves and consider how they wish to move forward.

In between, so to speak, the Dream and Design phases the Ignatian tradition can further assist advisees by helping them notice areas of *interior freedom* as well as areas that might be limiting their full growth and potential. Occasional honest and reflective questions related to their overall health, well-being, hopes, and interests can identify

current realities and struggles. By inquiring about anxieties, fears, or other limitations they are experiencing, advisors can help students name what is limiting them, and by naming obstacles, provide opportunities for them to weigh these against their deeper hopes and desires. Again, while the role of an advisor is not to be a mental health counselor or spiritual director, advisors still have the ability to assist students in their overall growth and human development. Helping students name their Dreams opens up new possibilities. Drawing from the perspective of a mentoring relationship, and grounded in the notion of accompaniment, the Ignatian advisor invites students to explore their vocations in the context of the full development of their sense of self and their relationship with the world.

The Design phase of Appreciative Advising is where students and advisors co-create an action plan to realize and organize their goals and dreams. Advising using aspects of Ignatian discernment complements the Design phase by providing the opportunity for conversations that consider the values and virtues, along with potential pitfalls and limitations of a choice. Asking directed questions such as “What aspects of X are you good at?” or “Which aspects are you not very skilled? Where do you need to gain more experience?” helps students consider the pros and cons of a major or career. Furthermore, they allow a student to consider what kind of person they will be in that profession. Open-ended questions like these create a context for accomplishing the more practical task of selecting courses, majors, or internships, in light of the aspirations they are developing for their life and careers.

As one might imagine, providing hope and encouragement to students as they set upon their chosen path in the Deliver phase overlaps well with the Ignatian concept of Action in the five-step method of Ignatian Pedagogy. Action in this sense is the result of taking what one has experienced and then reflected upon to consider what a particular choice means to the student personally. The student may then make choices or take steps that manifest those reflections. While the Deliver phase calls students to put forward their best effort to accomplish their goals, Ignatian advisors also encourage students to recognize that

through this process, they are also growing in authentic self-awareness.

The Don’t Settle phase suggests a restlessness for continual improvement, similar to the Ignatian concept of seeking the *Magis*. Pursuing the better option includes an awareness and reflection not only for self-improvement but also for growth in knowing oneself and how one may be of service to those in need. For Ignatian advisors, the idea of the *Magis* can be helpful as it encourages advisors to share with students what they see in them, their potential, their gifts. It encourages students to stretch their minds and hearts and to be willing to be stretched by the reality of the world, especially by those who are poor and in need. Advisors can confirm student choices when they see how these choices match their skills and interests with their values and deeper desires for themselves.

As we have tried to show, Appreciative Advising and Ignatian Advising offer ways to engage students that go well beyond problem-solving, granting permission for courses, or selecting majors. Appreciative Advising provides a solid framework of six phases, each of which has accompanying goals and practical steps for reaching them. Appreciative Advising is well-researched as an effective advising practice. The idea of advising from an Ignatian perspective is relatively new idea with limited research supporting it, although the other essays in this issue offer promising first steps. However, Ignatian spirituality and the charisms of the Ignatian tradition that ground Jesuit higher education have nearly 500 years of history and practice. The idea of educating from an Ignatian perspective has been tested over time and throughout most all continents and numerous countries throughout the world. In this sense, the application of the Ignatian charisms and Ignatian Pedagogy to the advising process rests on a solid foundation.

Going Forward: Appreciative Ignatian Advising in Practice

Realizing that many aspects of the initial advising process often occur in short intervals may make it seem like achieving what has been suggested above is overly idealistic or even impossible. True mentoring requires extensive dedicated time. As we have stated, it is not the responsibility of an

advisor, a faculty member, or any one person on campus to take on the full development of any student. It is, however, the responsibility of each and every faculty and staff member to do their part in engaging students, helping them along their journey of learning and personal development. When each person on campus who supports a student does his or her part, especially when utilizing aspects of Appreciative and Ignatian Advising, students benefit greatly. The student receives a mentoring-level of support not through the efforts of one individually, but collectively, through the collaborative actions of each of the faculty and staff the student may encounter.

Advisors do not need to know all the details of a student's life in order to serve him or her well. They can use their role and the allotted meeting time to plant seeds, ask meaningful questions, and provide resources and suggestions that create a trusting and ongoing relationship. Preparation is key for advisors (and students) to make the most of their limited time together. Students sometimes receive notices of how they should prepare (bring your schedule, your questions, show up on time, run your graduation transcript, etc.). Advisors can also prepare by looking to these one on one meetings as an opportunity to develop a meaningful relationship and focusing on the gifts that each student brings. They may reflect on how they might raise their own vision, goals, or horizon of these encounters to include a desire to serve students in ways that develop them as whole persons, helping students claim their own authenticity. Advisors can be alert to clues that point to students' deeper desires, their authentic vocation, and how they might utilize their gifts in the service of those in need.

In closing, we suggest some additional resources and strategies for advisors who wish to infuse their role with best practices drawn from the blending of Appreciate and Ignatian approaches to advising.

- Stay current with research and recommendations related to Appreciative Advising by consulting the *Journal of Appreciative Education* or by attending one of the national workshops offered in partnership with NACADA or the Appreciative
- Reimagine advising meetings as an opportunity to accompany students, to journey with them. Often, advisors have a chance to meet several times over an extended period. Consider the approximate number of times one will meet with an advisee over the course of a semester or year and make plans for conversations in future sessions. Be sure to keep notes or records of conversations to review later, allowing you to demonstrate to your advisee that you remember and value previous conversations.
- Include aspects of mentoring into you advising style. Embrace the attitude and awareness of a mentor, seeking the best for each advisee, sharing what gifts you see in your students, encouraging their potential and abilities, and challenging them for further growth. Through this approach you can frame big questions to help students consider their life as a whole in relation to the particular issues at hand.
- Just as you prepare for your meetings with students, give students their own "homework" to prepare as well. Include reflective questions during advising sessions. Begin with developing relationships and learning

Advising Institute.²⁸ NACADA has a tremendous wealth of resources on their website and sponsors national and regional conferences.²⁹ Likewise, the Association of Jesuit Colleges and Universities (AJCU) and individual Jesuit universities frequently offer mission-related faculty and staff development opportunities whether specifically related to Ignatian Pedagogy or the Jesuit mission more broadly.³⁰ These can be valuable opportunities to network with peers across campus to share ideas and techniques to promote student success.

about your advisees, then move on, in following sessions, to more in-depth questions. You might create a handout with a few questions based on the level or number of meetings you expect to have with your advisees. For example, a first-time meeting with a first-year student may need simpler questions to initiate a practice of reflecting whereas those in their final years of their undergraduate experience may be ready for more probing questions. Providing bold questions and giving advisees time to consider them in advance creates a sense of continuity between meetings.

- Advisors can also develop a “mentoring environment”³¹ among their colleagues for sharing ideas and best practices. Consider creating a formal or informal group (if one does not exist already) that might bring together those invested in advising. In particular, conversations between faculty and student life professionals can be especially valuable and instructive. Creating a reading group or working with the Dean’s office for annual advising workshops or retreats can further develop a shared philosophy and common practices that will give continuity so that a student’s experience of advising during her undergraduate career feels integrated, intentional, and connected.

While advisors have much that they can do to engage and assist a student, part of the role of Ignatian advising is to help students learn about themselves, recognize the gifts and skills they already have, and use those to tackle the upcoming challenges. Ignatian advisors go further to intentionally direct and help develop the whole person, mind, body, and spirit. They seek to help

students develop a healthy sense of self, recognize and learn about their relationship with others, and develop their skills with the intention of using them to serve society or those in need in some way. In essence, developing habits in the self-reflective student, or in Jesuit parlance, to become a “contemplative in action,”³² is an incredible set of skills for students as leaders and citizens.

From the tradition of Ignatian spirituality, advisors can learn to listen for a student’s deeper desires, consolations, and energy, including those areas that block their full potential for growth.³³ They can encourage students to reflect on their desires, interests, gifts, values, identity, and potential options and help them to recognize what most resonates with who they seek to become. Advisors have a unique opportunity to help students create a horizon that includes using their gifts and talents toward the service of those who are in need, especially the poor and marginalized.

Conclusion

Comprehensive secular advising approaches, such as Appreciative Advising, allow advisors to help students solve problems as well as increase the student’s sense of agency and holistic growth through creating practical and achievable plans to reach their goals. Ignatian advising, in one sense a new concept in the field of advising, draws its foundation from Ignatian spirituality, Ignatian Pedagogy, and Jesuit education and can add an additional dimension to secular approaches. In this sense, it applies an almost 500-year-old tradition that has been practiced in nearly every continent with incredibly diverse cultures and circumstances across the world to university advising. As a value-laden pedagogy and educational endeavor, Ignatian advising seeks the development of the whole person, her mind and body certainly, but also her spirit and does so in a way that unites rather than separates various aspects of the person and serves her more fully and holistically. HJE

Notes

¹ An excellent overview can be found in *Academic Advising Approaches: Strategies That Teach Students to Make the Most of*

College, edited by Jayne R. Drake, Peggy Jordan, and Marsha Miller (San Francisco, CA: Jossey Bass/NACADA, 2013).

² Bloom, Hutson, He, & Konkle, *The Appreciative Advising Revolution Training Book: Translating Theory to Practice*,

(Champaign, IL: Stripes Publishing L.L.C., 2014). There is an extensive body of research on Appreciative Advising; see "Appreciative Advising Bibliography," NACADA Clearinghouse, November 4, 2012, <https://nacada.ksu.edu/Resources/Clearinghouse/View-Articles/Appreciative-advising-bibliography.aspx>.

³ Alexander C. Kafka, "At 2 Jesuit Colleges, Aligning Passion and Profession," *The Chronicle of Higher Education*, September 8, 2019, https://www.chronicle.com/article/at-2-jesuit-colleges-aligning-passion-and-profession/?cid2=gen_login_refresh&cid=gen_sign_in.

⁴ Richard Light, *Making the Most of College: Students Speak Their Minds*, rev. ed. (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2004); Sharon Daloz Parks, *Big Questions, Worthy Dreams: Mentoring Young Adults in Their Search for Meaning, Purpose, and Faith* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2000). The notion of including aspects of mentoring in advising has considered best practice for some time now. For additional references, see "Be an Exceptional Academic Advisor, Share Yourself, Become a Mentor," NACADA Clearinghouse, December 1, 2006, <https://nacada.ksu.edu/Resources/Academic-Advising-Today/View-Articles/Be-an-Exceptional-Academic-Advisor-Share-Yourself-Become-a-Mentor.aspx>. Other sources include: Allison E. McWilliams and Lauren R. Beam, "Advising, Counseling, Coaching, Mentoring: Models of Developmental Relationships in Higher Education," *The Mentor: An Academic Advising Journal* 15 (2013), <https://doi.org/10.26209/mj1561280>; Scott Carlson, "A Crusade Against Terrible Advising," *The Chronicle of Higher Education*, August 4, 2020, <https://www.chronicle.com/article/a-crusade-against-terrible-advising>. For higher education programs connecting advising to mentoring, see "Temple University Advising/Mentoring Program," NACADA Clearinghouse, February 26, 2018, <https://nacada.ksu.edu/Resources/Academic-Advising-Today/View-Articles/Temple-University-Advisor-Mentoring-Program.aspx>; Brown University Graduate School, "Advising and Mentoring Resources for Faculty," accessed October 13, 2020, <https://www.brown.edu/academics/gradschool/academics-research/graduate-advising-and-mentoring/advising-and-mentoring-resources-faculty>; Carleton College, "Practice Good Advising and Mentoring," accessed October 13, 2020, https://serc.carleton.edu/integrate/programs/diversity/advising_mentoring.html.

⁵ The International Commission on the Apostolate of Jesuit Education (ICAJE), *Ignatian Pedagogy: A Practical Approach* (1993), s. 128, http://www.sjweb.info/documents/education/pedagogy_en.pdf.

⁶ *Ignatian Pedagogy: A Practical Approach*, s. 11. Over the past decade there has been a growing engagement with Ignatian Pedagogy in Jesuit higher education including the establishment of centers of teaching and learning using Ignatian Pedagogy. For a digital collection of resources on Ignatian Pedagogy and much more, see Zheng (Jessica) Lu and Vicki Rosen, "Practicing Ignatian Pedagogy: A Digital Collection of Resources," *Jesuit Higher Education: A Journal* 4, no. 2 (2015): 135-152,

<https://epublications.regis.edu/jhe/vol4/iss2/29/>. For Ignatian Pedagogy and centers of teaching and learning, see "The Scholarship of Teaching and Learning: Ignatian Pedagogy," Loyola University Chicago accessed October 13, 2020, https://libguides.luc.edu/scholarship_tl/ip. For a collection of conference essays on Ignatian Pedagogy and feminist education, see Jocelyn M. Boryczka and Elizabeth A. Petrino, eds., *Jesuit & Feminist Education: Intersections in Teaching and Learning for the Twenty-first Century* (New York: Fordham University Press, 2012).

⁷ Louis J. Puhl, S.J., *The Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius: Based on Studies in the Language of the Autograph* (Chicago: Newman Press, 1951). For more description of Ignatian spirituality and the Spiritual Exercises, see "The Spiritual Exercises," IgnatianSpirituality.com, accessed October 9, 2020, <https://www.ignatianspirituality.com/ignatian-prayer/the-spiritual-exercises/>.

⁸ Parks, *Big Questions, Worthy Dreams*.

⁹ The vision and five-step method of Ignatian pedagogy was developed in two separate but related documents one on the vision/characteristics, International Commission on the Apostolate of Jesuit Education (ICAJE), *The Characteristics of Jesuit Education* (1986), http://www.sjweb.info/documents/education/characteristics_en.pdf; and the other on the 5-step method: ICAJE, *Ignatian Pedagogy: A Practical Approach*, http://www.sjweb.info/documents/education/pedagogy_en.pdf. For additional treatment of aspects relating to Ignatian Pedagogy, see Vincent J. Duminuco S.J., ed., *The Jesuit Ratio Studiorum, 400th Anniversary Perspectives* (New York: Fordham University Press., 2000).

¹⁰ *Ignatian Pedagogy*, s. 32-70.

¹¹ *Ignatian Pedagogy*, s. 42.

¹² For dissertation research on engagement of Ignatian Pedagogy and points of commonality with other higher education pedagogical strategies, see Joseph A. DeFeo, "Old Wine in New Skin: Ignatian Pedagogy, Compatible and Contributing to Jesuit Higher Education," (Ph.D. Diss., Fordham University, 2009), <https://www.proquest.com/docview/304879778>.

¹³ Barton T. Geger, S.J., "Cura Personalis: Some Ignatian Inspirations," *Jesuit Higher Education: A Journal* 3, no. 2 (2014): 6, <https://epublications.regis.edu/jhe/vol3/iss2/2>.

¹⁴ Frederick Buechner, *Wishful Thinking: A Seeker's ABC* (San Francisco, Harper Collins, 1993), 118-119.

¹⁵ For an additional example of vocation that aligns with an Ignatian sense of vocation, see Parker Palmer, *Let Your Life Speak: Listening for the Voice of Vocation* (San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, 2000).

¹⁶ For several descriptions of the Ignatian Examen, see: Jim Manney, *a simple, life-changing prayer: Discovering the Power of Saint Ignatius Loyola's Examen* (Chicago, Illinois: Loyola Press, 2011); Dennis Hamm, S.J., "Rummaging for God: Praying Backwards Through Your Day," IgnatianSpirituality.com,

reprinted from *America*, May 14, 1994,
<https://www.ignatianspirituality.com/ignatian-prayer/the-examen/rummaging-for-god-praying-backward-through-your-day/>

¹⁷ Adapting the questions in the Ignatian Examen to a particular audience can assist participants engagement of the experience. One example of adapting the five themes of the Ignatian Examen for faculty that was developed by Joseph DeFeo is the following: 1) *Thanksgiving/Gratitude*: Lord, I realize that everything and everyone, myself and my students, are a gift from you. *As I recall my students and course/s, for what am I most grateful?* 2) *Illumination/Awareness*: Lord, open my eyes, ears, and heart to be more honest with myself. *As I recall my students and course/s, what did I really want for myself?* 3) *Examen*: Lord, help me look more closely at my students and myself. *As I recall my students and course/s, where did our gifts and abilities really shine brightly?* 4) *Missing the Mark/ Areas for Growth*: Lord, I know I have room to grow in my response to the gifts and invitations of others. *As I recall my students and course/s, where did I fall short of meeting my students?* 5) *Hope/ Going Forward*: Lord, let me look ahead with a renewed sense of hope and commitment. *As I imagine my students and course/s, for what I am most looking forward to?*

¹⁸ For more description of spiritual freedom/interior freedom see Kevin O'Brien, S.J., *The Ignatian Adventure: Experiencing the Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius in Daily Life* (Chicago, Loyola Press, 2011), 57-58.

¹⁹ Chris Lowney, *Pope Francis: Why He Leads the Way He Leads* (Chicago: Loyola Press, 2013), 111-17.

²⁰ For more about the process Ignatian discernment and the three 'ways' of Ignatian decision-making see James Martin, S.J., *The Jesuit Guide to Almost Everything: A Spirituality for Real Life* (New York: HarperOne, 2010), 305-338. See also Elizabeth Liebert, SNJM, *The Way of Discernment: Spiritual Practices for Decision Making* (Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 2008).

²¹ For more about Ignatian discernment leadership in this issue see Joseph DeFeo, "Discerning Leaders: Forming Jesuit Higher Education Administrators and Faculty in the Ignatian Tradition."

²² Barton T. Geger, S.J., "What *Magis* Really Means and Why It Matters," *Jesuit Higher Education: A Journal* 1, no. 2 (2012), <https://epublications.regis.edu/jhe/vol1/iss2/16/>; see also Martin, *The Jesuit Guide to Almost Everything*, 369-371.

²³ Bloom et al., *The Appreciative Advising Revolution Training Book*.

²⁴ Bloom et al., *The Appreciative Advising Revolution Training Book*, 43.

²⁵ Bloom et al., *The Appreciative Advising Revolution Training Book*, 53.

²⁶ Parks, *Big Questions, Worthy Dreams*, 190-192.

²⁷ Parks, *Big Questions, Worthy Dreams*, 137-138.

²⁸ *Journal of Appreciative Education*, accessed October 28, 2020, <http://libjournal.uncg.edu/jae/>; Appreciative Advising Institute, accessed October 28, 2020, <https://www.fau.edu/education/centersandprograms/oae/ai/>

²⁹ National Academic Advising Association (NACADA), accessed August 12, 2020, <https://nacada.ksu.edu/>

³⁰ Association of Jesuit College & Universities, accessed October 28, 2020, <https://www.ajcunet.edu/>

³¹ For more on developing a mentoring community, see Parks, *Big Questions, Worthy Dreams*, chapter 8, "The Gifts of a Mentoring Environment."

³² For more description see Andy Otto, "Contemplatives in Action," Ignatian Spirituality.com, accessed October 13, 2020, <https://www.ignatianspirituality.com/contemplatives-in-action/>.

³³ For examples of consolation in Ignatian spirituality, see Ignatian Spirituality.com, accessed August 12, 2020, <https://www.ignatianspirituality.com/?s=consolation>